1	
2	
3	
4	REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
5	
6	MEETING OF THE
7	CALIFORNIA PRIVACY PROTECTION AGENCY
8	
9	PUBLIC COMMENT SESSION
10	TUESDAY, JUNE 10, 2025
11	
12	Pages 1 - 13
13	
14	Cannabis Control Appeals Panel Hearing Room
15	400 R Street, Suite 350, Sacramento, California 95811
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	Transcribed by: iDepo Reporters 898 North Pacific Coast Highway
24	Suite 475 El Segundo, California 90245
25	(323) 393-3768



Reporters

1	APPEARANCES:
2	
3	Tom Kemp, CPPA Executive Director
4	Megan White, CPPA Deputy Director of Public and
5	External Affairs
6	Philip Laird, CPPA General Counsel
7	Tamara Michelle Colson, CPPA Assistant Chief Counsel
8	Serena Marzion, CPPA Moderator
9	Benjaman Isaacson
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	



1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

package.

TUESDAY, JUNE 10, 2025 1:00 p.m. -000-MR. KEMP: Good afternoon, and welcome to the California Privacy Protection Agency Public Comment Session on the proposed regulations for the delete, request, and opt out platform, or DROP, system requirements. My name is Tom Kemp, and I serve as the Agency's executive director. Today is Tuesday, June 10, 2025, at approximately 1 p.m. I am located at the California Cannabis Appeals Panel Hearing Room at 400 R Street in Sacramento, California. The hearing is also being broadcast online to allow for virtual participation. Here with me today are Phil Laird, our Agency's general counsel, Tamara Colson, assistant chief counsel for the Agency's legal division, Deputy Director Megan White, and Serena Marzion with our public affairs division. Today is the last day the Agency will be accepting public comments orally or in writing on these draft regulations as proposed in the notice

iDepo Reporters

1	I sincerely appreciate everyone's
2	participation in the process and look forward to
3	listening to your comments today.
4	Now, I'll turn it over to Phil for a few
5	housekeeping matters before we start.
6	MR. LAIRD: Thanks, Tom.
7	Just a few points to make before we get
8	going. During this hearing, we will listen to and
9	record the comments from members of the public about
10	the proposed regulations. You may also submit
11	written public comments to staff here physically by
12	e-mailing them to regulations@cppa.ca.gov, or by
13	mailing them to the Agency's Sacramento office. All
14	comments are due today, and written comments must be
15	received by 5:00 p.m.
16	Please note that oral and written
17	comments are treated equally, so you are only
18	required to submit your comment by one method for it
19	to be considered and responded to in the final rule
20	making record.
21	Now, given the number of participants in
22	attendance today, we will begin by limiting comments
23	to three minutes per speaker. Once all participants
24	have had an opportunity to make a three minute
25	comment, we will allow speakers to make additional

1	comments if they were unable to complete their
2	remarks during the first round.
3	If there are still members of the public
4	waiting to make a comment at 3:00 p.m. we will
5	continue the hearing until everyone has had a chance
6	to make their comment. Otherwise, we will conclude
7	the hearing at 3:00, as stated on the notice.
8	So, in terms of how you participate, if
9	you are attending in person and wish to speak, please
10	wait for me to call for public comment, then move
11	toward the podium and form a line.
12	It is helpful if you identify yourself
13	when you begin speaking. But this is entirely
14	voluntary, and you are free to refer to yourself with
15	a pseudonym or not give a name. We will first take
16	comments from those in person, and then move to those
17	who are joining us virtually.
18	If you were here in person, please hold
19	the microphone very close to your mouth, and speak
20	directly into the mic so everyone participating
21	remotely can hear you, and so your remarks can be
22	recorded in the meeting record. If you're attending
23	via Zoom and you wish to speak, please use the raise
24	your hand function, which is in the reaction feature
25	at the bottom of your Zoom screen. If you're joining

by phone, please press star-nine on your phone to 1 show the moderator that you're raising your hand. 2 Our moderator will call your name when it 3 is your turn and request that you unmute yourself to 4 5 make your comment. When your comment is completed, the moderator will mute you. As is the case with 6 in-person participation, it is helpful if you 7 identify yourself, but this is entirely voluntary. 8 9 Now, in the event of technical 10 difficulties, and you're attending remotely and experience an issue with the remote meeting, for 11 12 example, audio dropping or something of that nature, 13 please e-mail info@cppa.ca.gov. That's I-N-F-O at 14 CPPA, dot CA, dot GOV. This e-mail account will be 15 monitored throughout the meeting. If there is an issue that affects the remote meeting, we will pause 16 17 the meeting to let our technical staff work on fixing 18 the issue.

Now, we will not be responding to the public comments or discussing the requirements in the proposed regulations during today's hearing. But in accordance with the Administrative Procedures Act, all public comments submitted during the comment period, including the oral comments from today's hearing, will be responded to in the Agency's final



Γ

1	statement of reasons later in the rulemaking process.
2	After considering the public comments,
3	the agency may propose amendments to the proposed
4	the original proposed text to the regulations. If
5	the Agency proposes such amendments, each person who
6	has provided a public comment will receive notice of
7	the proposed amendments to the text. To receive this
8	notice, however, you will need to provide us with an
9	e-mail or mailing address as part of your public
10	comment.
11	I just want to echo Mr. Kemp to say,
12	thank you so much for being here today. We truly
13	value your comments and carefully consider all the
14	feedback we receive.
15	And so, with no further ado, I'm going to
16	turn it over now to Ms. Marzion, who's serving as our
17	moderator today.
18	MS. MARZION: Thank you so much, Phil.
19	We are now open for public comment.
20	You'll have three minutes to state your public
21	comment, and I'll give you a thirty-second warning.
22	We'll first take comments from attendees in the room.
23	If you'd like to take to make a
24	comment, please form a line by the podium.
25	We will now be taking comment from

Page 8	3
--------	---

1	virtual attendees. To make a public comment at this
2	time, please raise your hand by using the raise hand
3	feature or by pressing star-nine. If you're joining
4	us by phone, I'll call your name and unmute you when
5	it's your turn to speak.
6	Benjamin Isaacson, I'm going to unmute
7	you now. You'll have three minutes.
8	MR. ISAACSON: Thank you. My name is Ben
9	Isaacson. I am the principal at In-House Privacy,
10	Inc. We're a law practice based in California.
11	MS. MARZION: Benjamin, you can go ahead
12	and speak. You are unmuted.
13	MR. ISAACSON: Thank you. My name is Ben
14	Isaacson. I'm the principal with In-House Privacy,
15	Inc. We are a law practice based in California.
16	These comments reflect my own. They do not reflect
17	any particular clients of ours. We will be
18	submitting written comments, but I'd like to
19	summarize a few key policy points.
20	MS. MARZION: Benjamin, do you mind just
21	holding for a few, I can't hear you. One second.
22	Okay. Benjamin, if you can begin again.
23	MR. ISAACSON: Okay. Can you hear me
24	now?
25	MS. MARZION: Yes.

MR. ISAACSON: Great, thank you. 1 So the first -- the first policy point 2 is, you know, due to the statutory penalties inherent 3 in SB 362, the Delete Act, that directly apply to the 4 5 DROP mechanism, we recommend that there be a cure period, or at least a warning system, that the CPPA 6 adopt as part of these regulations to allow for 7 erroneous applications of the DROP, at least within, 8 you know, the one year plus of implementation to 9 10 avoid, you know, the complications of potential statutory penalties where companies are data brokers, 11 are operating in good faith, attempting to comply, 12 13 but do run into errors or mistakes in their 14 application. 15 Another potential regulation that should be added to the scope of the DROP, as well as, you 16 17 know, the definition of data broker, are intermediaries that provide services to data brokers 18 19 that should be exempt from registration with the 20 DROP. And, in particular, the examples are advertising and marketing agencies and 21 2.2 software-as-a-service platforms. 23 These entities make available third-party 24 data, but they do so under a service provider 25 agreement with their clients. So, they are directly

required to procure the third-party data on their behalf. They might, you know, provide that data as part of a platform to use for things like e-mail, marketing, or call centers. But they shouldn't be included as part of the definition of data broker.

And a number of companies are very confused about whether they do need to register and participate in the DROP, and apply the deletion and, potentially, suppression files before they share that data with clients.

And then another area where there's 11 confusion is whether or not consent -- in this case, 12 13 we'll just call it affirmative consent, would 14 override an individual's participation in the DROP. 15 And so, the example being a consumer registers with the DROP, and then later on they participate in a 16 17 sweepstakes or some other incentive program where 18 there is an explicit consent provided to sell their data to data brokers. In which case, those data 19 20 brokers would seemingly not be able to use that data 21 because of the individual's participation in the DROP, regardless of whether they had affirmative 2.2 23 consent and any evidence of capturing that after the 24 DROP.

25

6

7

8

9

10

And then the last comment I'm going to



make today is related to just the overall technical 1 requirements as part of the DROP regulations. 2 And, again, you know, we are providing written comments 3 that go into more detail, but don't necessarily 4 5 reflect the interest of small businesses. Many of the data brokers on the registry are small businesses 6 that don't necessarily maintain data bases in the 7 traditional sense that you would think of it with 8 9 data brokers.

10 These are companies that might procure a list from one data broker or multiple data brokers, 11 and then combine them and pass them off to their 12 13 clients for use with their marketing or other 14 campaigns. But they're not necessarily sophisticated 15 in the same way that I think that some of the assumptions made in the DROP, in particular, some of 16 17 the requirements to engage in data hygiene, and combining data attributes, or different data, you 18 know, data points about, you know, mobile ad ID's or 19 20 other e-mail addresses that they might possess in cross-disparate networks where, you know, some of the 21 comments that we're making just to the -- to make it 2.2 23 more simple in terms of how the DROP is applied to 24 lists that they might possess at that moment. But 25 not necessarily to create databases and technical

infrastructure in order to support some of the more 1 2 complicated aspects of the DROP. 3 So thank you for your time today, and, you know, you'll -- my time. 4 Thank you for your comment. 5 MS. MARZION: All right. Thank you so much. 6 If you would like to make a comment and you're joining this 7 virtually, to make a public comment at this time, 8 9 please raise your hand using the raise hand feature, 10 or by pressing star-nine if you're joining us by phone. I'll call your name and unmute you when it's 11 12 your turn. 13 MR. LAIRD: As we approach the end of our 14 time for this hearing, 3:00 p.m., we just want to say 15 thank you to those that joined us today and participated in this comment period, as well as those 16 submitting their written comments. We again really 17 appreciate your participation in this rulemaking 18 19 process. 20 Thank you for your time. And that concludes this hearing for the California Privacy 21 2.2 Protection Agency. 23 (End of recorded audio.) 24 25

1	State of California)
2)ss.
3	County of Sacramento)
4	
5	
6	
7	IDepo Reporters transcriptionist hereby
8	certify:
9	The proceedings were transcribed from
10	audio files by us;
11	The foregoing audio transcription is a
12	true and correct transcript to the best of our
13	ability;
14	we further certify that we are neither
15	counsel for nor related to any party to
16	said action, nor in any way interested in
17	the outcome thereof.
18	
19	In witness whereof, we have hereunto
20	subscribed our name this 17th day of June, 2025.
21	
22	
23	iDepo Reporters 898 North Pacific Coast Highway
24	Suite 475 El Segundo, California 90245
25	(323) 393-3768

