

1 **CALIFORNIA PRIVACY PROTECTION AGENCY BOARD**

2 TRANSCRIPTION OF RECORDED PUBLIC MEETING

3  
4 **APRIL 14, 2023**

5 **SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA**

6  
7  
8 Present: JENNIFER M. URBAN, Chairperson  
9 LYDIA DE LA TORRE, Board Member  
10 VINHCENT LE, Board Member  
11 ALASTAIR MACTAGGART, Board Member  
12 ASHKAN SOLTANI, Executive Director  
13 ELIZABETH ALLEN, Moderator

14  
15  
16 Transcribed by:  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1           **MS. ELIZABETH ALLEN:** Okay, we have leveled off. We should  
2 start.

3           **MS. JENNIFER URBAN:** Thank you very much, Ms. Allen. And to  
4 everyone: welcome. Good afternoon. I'm pleased to welcome you to  
5 this meeting of the California Privacy Protection Agency Board. It  
6 is April 14th, 2023, at 2:31PM. I'm Jennifer Urban and I'm the  
7 Chairperson of the Board. Before we get started with the substance  
8 of the meeting, as usual, I have some logistical announcements to  
9 make sure that everyone's on the same page with the meeting and can  
10 participate effectively if you would like.

11           First, I would like to ask that everyone please check that  
12 your microphone is muted when you are not speaking. Additionally,  
13 please note that this meeting is being recorded. The meeting will  
14 be run today according to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, which  
15 is required by law. After each agenda item, there will be an  
16 opportunity for questions and discussion by Board members. We have  
17 a designated time on the agenda for general public comments—that's  
18 agenda number four today. I will also ask for public comments on  
19 each specific agenda item. Each speaker will be limited to three  
20 minutes per agenda item. If you wish to speak on an item and you're  
21 using the Zoom webinar, please use the 'raise your hand' function,  
22 which, if you want to take a second to locate now, is in the  
23 reaction feature at the bottom of your Zoom screen. If you wish to  
24 speak on an item and are joining by phone, please press \*9 on your  
25 phone and that will show the moderator that you are raising your  
26 hand. Our moderator will call your name when it is your turn, and  
27 request that you unmute yourself for comments at that time. Those  
28 using the webinar can use the unmute feature on the screen and

1 those dialing in by phone can press \*6 to unmute. When your comment  
2 is completed, our moderator will mute you.

3 It is helpful if you identify yourself, but this is voluntary,  
4 and you can input a pseudonym when you log into the meeting. The  
5 Board welcomes public comments on any agenda item, and it is our  
6 intent to ask for public comment prior to the Board voting on any  
7 agenda item. If for some reason I forget to ask for public comments  
8 on the agenda item and you wish to speak on that item, please just  
9 let us know by raising, using the 'raise your hand' functions, and  
10 the moderator will recognize you. You will then have the three  
11 minutes to speak on that item.

12 Relatedly, I would like to remind everyone of the rules of the  
13 road of Bagley-Keene. Both Board members and members of the public  
14 may discuss agendized items only. If you are speaking on an agenda  
15 item, both Board members and members of the public must contain  
16 their comments to that agenda item. Items not on the agenda for  
17 today can be suggested for discussion at one of our future meetings  
18 when the Board takes up the agenda item designated for that  
19 purpose. It's number five today.

20 Today's meeting has a relatively brief agenda, but we will  
21 take breaks as needed. Please note that the sixth agenda item for  
22 today is a closed session item. The Board will leave this public  
23 session for that discussion, but we'll leave the public session  
24 open. And when we are finished with the closed session item, the  
25 Board will return to this public meeting in order to adjourn. My  
26 many thanks to our Board members for their service and to all the  
27 people working today to make the meeting possible. I'd like to  
28 thank by name the team supporting us today: Mr. Brian Soublet,

1 who's our meeting counsel today. Welcome, Mr. Soublet. Mr. Ashkan  
2 Soltani, who's here in our capacity as our executive director. And  
3 I would like to thank and welcome our moderator today, Ms.  
4 Elizabeth Allen, and ask her to please, now, conduct the roll call.

5 **MS. ALLEN:** Yes. Board Member de la Torre?

6 **MS. LYDIA DE LA TORRE:** Present.

7 **MS. ALLEN:** de la Torre is present. Board Member Le?

8 **MR. VINHCENT LE:** Present.

9 **MS. ALLEN:** Board Member Le, present. Board Member Mactaggart?

10 Mactaggart is not present. Chair Urban?

11 **MS. URBAN:** Present.

12 **MS. ALLEN:** Urban, present. And with that, you have three out  
13 of four and you have quorum.

14 **MS. URBAN:** Thank you very much, Ms. Allen. The Board has  
15 established a quorum. We expect Mr. Mactaggart to come for part of  
16 the meeting, and we'll welcome him at that time. I would like to  
17 let Board members know that we will take a roll call vote if we  
18 have any action items today. With that, we will move to agenda item  
19 number two, which is an update from the chairperson. I have a  
20 couple of short updates. I realize that I may seem to roll this  
21 over every time, but it really does seem like our strategic  
22 planning consultant contract is almost done so I'm hoping that we  
23 can pick that up in earnest in our next meeting. It is positive  
24 movement. It's just taking a little while because the process does.  
25 I would like to congratulate Mr. Nelson Richards who has been  
26 appointed as the Agency's Assistant Chief Counsel. Mr. Richards  
27 came to the Agency from the Government Law Section at the  
28 California Department of Justice and has proved an invaluable

1 resource to the team so I wanted to offer him warm congratulations  
2 and welcome to the new role. I'd also like to thank Mr. Brian  
3 Soublet, who is a familiar face for folks who've joined our  
4 meetings before, who's stepping in to reprise his role as acting  
5 general counsel while our general counsel, Mr. Philip Laird, is on  
6 paternity leave. So, we're happy for Mr. Laird, and we're glad to  
7 have Mr. Soublet with us today.

8 I'm also delighted to announce that our rulemaking package—  
9 now, the rulemaking package that many people in attendance probably  
10 commented on over the last months—that we approved as a Board in  
11 early February—has been approved by the Office of Administrative  
12 Law and filed with the Secretary of the State on March 29th. The  
13 rules are final and effective as of that date. We talked about the  
14 effort that went into this when we approved the package to go to  
15 OAL, but I do just want to reiterate my—and I'm sure the rest of  
16 the Board's—many thanks to staff for being incredibly competent,  
17 careful, thoughtful, creative work and being responsive to the  
18 public. My many thanks to the public for an incredibly robust  
19 rulemaking process with a tremendous amount of information offered  
20 to the Agency to help us improve the rules. Very much appreciated.  
21 And my thanks to the Board. As we knew from the very beginning, we  
22 started with no staff; we have been lightly staffed; and we have an  
23 absolutely wonderful staff. At the same time, this Board has been  
24 very substantively involved, lent its expertise to this effort, and  
25 I'm very proud of what we have accomplished, and thank you all for  
26 that.

27 Next steps on rulemaking: I believe our executive director  
28 will say a little bit about that, but thanks to the public,

1 everyone who has submitted public comments in response to our  
2 initial request for comment on automated decision-making, risk  
3 assessments, and cybersecurity audits. I have my binders of public  
4 comments and I'm very excited about that. And I think Mr. Soltani  
5 is going to give an update on rulemaking efforts. To suffice to  
6 say, we are moving right along. So, thank you to the staff for  
7 that; the new rules subcommittee, which is Ms. de la Torre  
8 and Mr. Le, for their work; and to the public for what looked to be  
9 some very, again, extremely helpful comments. To keep up with our  
10 rulemaking work, staff has prepared an FAQ, which is at  
11 [ccpa.ca.gov](http://ccpa.ca.gov); regulations on the regulations page; and you can  
12 always sign up for our rulemaking email list in order to receive  
13 rulemaking communications directly. And there you can go to  
14 [cppa.ca.gov](http://cppa.ca.gov) and click on "Join Our Mailing List" on the front page.

15 So, those are my announcements. Are there any questions or  
16 comments from Board members?

17 **MS. URBAN:** No? Wonderful. Any public comments? Any questions  
18 or any comments from members of the public?

19 **MS. ALLEN:** We are on agenda item number two, the Chairperson  
20 Update. if you would like to make a comment, please raise your hand  
21 using the Zoom 'raise hand' feature or by pressing \*9 on your  
22 phone. Your name will be called when it's your turn, and you'll be  
23 invited to unmute yourself. Those dialing in on a phone can press  
24 \*6 to unmute, and you will have three minutes to make your comment.

25 Alright, again, if you would like to make a public comment on  
26 the chairperson's update, please go ahead and raise your hand or  
27 dial \*6.

28 Chairperson Urban, I'm not seeing any hands at this time.

1           **MS. URBAN:** Alright, thank you very much, Ms. Allen. And with  
2 that, we will move to agenda item number three, which is an update  
3 from our executive director Mr. Ashkan Soltani. I'm asking him to  
4 join us. Thank you, Mr. Soltani. Welcome and please go ahead.

5           **MR. ASHKAN SOLTANI:** Good afternoon. Thank you for the  
6 opportunity to provide a quick update today. This should be  
7 relatively short. First off, I want to echo the chair's praise for  
8 both the Board and staff on our conclusion of our first substantive  
9 CPPA regulations that were approved on the 29th. Many may be aware  
10 that the Board started the process for rulemaking with a  
11 preliminary invitation for comments in September of 2021, prior to  
12 my appointment and there really being an agency, and that was great  
13 foresight.

14           We received incredible substantive pre-rulemaking comments  
15 through that process, and in July of 2022, we kicked off the formal  
16 rulemaking process. I just want to express the thanks to the Board  
17 and the team for the tireless work. This is an incredible lift for  
18 a fledging agency, and I couldn't be more proud of the substance of  
19 the regs but also the process. I just want to thank DOJ, Department  
20 of Consumer Affairs, and all the other agencies that helped us on  
21 this journey. I think, again, it was a big lift, but I think we did  
22 a great job.

23           Along the second topic of pre-rulemaking, we also began a  
24 second invitation for pre-rulemaking comments on the topics of  
25 cybersecurity audits, risk assessments, and automated decision-  
26 making on February 10th of this year, and that just concluded on  
27 March 27, 2023. We received robust feedback in that process:  
28 something like 50 comments over another thousand pages of comments.

1 And staff are now working to review those comments to help inform  
2 their work further, including the work of the new subcommittee and,  
3 ultimately, the Board. Our IT staff are also now processing those  
4 comments and they should be available on our website and in the  
5 coming weeks. I hope in the next week or two that we'll have those  
6 redacted and available for the public.

7 And then finally, just quickly, staff are working actively on  
8 the topics that came up during the previous meetings prior to the  
9 rulemaking meetings, including additional topics for rulemaking;  
10 our budget change proposal, which we're currently still in  
11 negotiations with Finance including our cost-of-living adjustment;  
12 and additional topics such as the age-appropriate design working  
13 group.

14 And so, lastly, I appreciate the chair mentioning the FAQ.  
15 We're now in the process of updating our website to incorporate the  
16 updates as a result of the rules as well as the protections and  
17 responsibilities to California public, and so we should have  
18 iterative updates to the website in the coming weeks. And so, I'm  
19 happy to answer any questions, if there are any, otherwise, thank  
20 you all for getting us here.

21 **MS. URBAN:** Thank you so much, Mr. Soltani. Any comments or  
22 questions from the Board?

23 Alright, I will just reiterate thanks for an amazing job, an  
24 amazing effort, and keeping us on track. Ms. Allen, are there any  
25 comments from the public?

26 **MS. ALLEN:** Yes, we are on agenda item number three, the  
27 Executive Director's Update. If you would like to make a comment,  
28 please raise your hand using the Zoom 'raise hand' feature or by



1 pressing \*9 on your phone. Your name will be called when it's your  
2 turn, and you'll be invited to unmute yourself. Those dialing in by  
3 phone can press \*6 to unmute, and you will have three minutes to  
4 make your comment.

5 Again, if you would like to make a public comment, feel free  
6 to go ahead and raise your hand or dial \*9 on your phone. We are on  
7 agenda item three, Executive Director's update.

8 Chair Urban, I'm seeing no hands.

9 **MS. URBAN:** Thank you, Ms. Allen, and thank you, Mr. Soltani,  
10 for the update. With that, we'll turn to agenda item number four,  
11 which is our item for public comment on items not on the  
12 Agenda so this is an opportunity for members of the public to  
13 comment on things that we don't have on the agenda for today.  
14 Before we proceed with the public comments, please note that the  
15 only action the Board can take is to listen to comments and  
16 consider whether we'll discuss the topic at a future meeting. We  
17 can take no other action on the item at this meeting. It can seem,  
18 I know, at times like Board members are not being responsive, but  
19 this is not the intent. We are listening. Rather following these  
20 guidelines is crucial to ensure that the rules of the Bagley-Keene  
21 Open Meeting Act are followed and to avoid compromising either the  
22 commenter's goals or the Board's mission.

23 So, with that, I would like to ask if there are any members of  
24 the public who would like to comment at this point?

25 **MS. ALLEN:** Yes, great, again we are on agenda item number  
26 four, Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda. So, if you would  
27 like to make a comment, again, please raise your hand using the  
28 Zoom 'raise hand' feature or by pressing \*9 on your phone. Your

1 name will be called when it's your turn, and you'll be invited to  
2 unmute yourself. Those dialing in can press \*6 to unmute, and you  
3 will have three minutes to make your comment. Alright, Jen, I am  
4 going to invite you to unmute yourself, and you have three minutes.

5 **JEN:** Hello. I hope you can hear me.

6 **MS. ALLEN:** Yes, we can hear you.

7 **JEN:** Okay. I do have a question, and I've been trying to find  
8 this on the webpage, the CTPA, another webpage is about the  
9 limitation on cell phone tracking mechanisms or cell phone  
10 tracking. What are the rules because that's part of geolocation?

11 **MS. URBAN:** Thank you very much. Again, I apologize, we can't  
12 respond substantively due of the rules that we're under but thank  
13 you for the question. It's important to know that that's a question  
14 that you still have after looking at the website, and we will take  
15 it under advisement. Thanks so much.

16 **JEN:** Thank you.

17 **MS. ALLEN:** Alright, thank you so much. If anyone else has a  
18 public comment, please raise your hand using the Zoom 'raise hand'  
19 feature or by pressing \*9 on your phone. Your name will be called  
20 when it's your turn, and you'll be invited to unmute yourself.

21 Alright, I'm seeing no other hands, Chair Urban,

22 **MS. URBAN:** Thank you, Ms. Allen, and thank you again to Jen  
23 for the comment. We will move on to Future Agenda Items, which is  
24 agenda item number five. This is our designated agenda item for a  
25 discussion of topics that we may discuss in future meetings. For  
26 the Board members, I will give you an idea of the running list that  
27 we have. So, strategic planning is on the list. Last meeting, we  
28 talked about a regularized calendar for rulemaking, and Ms. de la

1 Torre and I, this sort of reconstituted process subcommittee, will,  
2 I presume, have an update about that, or staff will have an update,  
3 about that pretty soon. Ms. de la Torre and I, at some point, will  
4 have an update about the insurance analysis that that subcommittee  
5 is doing. In the next meeting, we expect to have an update from  
6 staff on regulation proposals and prioritization. There's a list of  
7 items that Board members have mentioned, for example, and there may  
8 be an additional update. The new rules subcommittee, I assume, you  
9 let us know when you have an update, but we can expect that at some  
10 point in future meetings. And where we've really kind of worked  
11 through looking at our various sort of regularized topics that we  
12 need to talk about, but I anticipate in our next meeting we'll take  
13 a look at that as a whole, so that we have our sort of plan for our  
14 meetings on budgets and legislation, et cetera moving forward. Any  
15 additional agenda items, Ms. de la Torre or Mr. Le, that you would  
16 like me - that I missed - or that you'd like me to add to the list?  
17 Ms. de la Torre?

18 **MS. DE LA TORRE:** Thank you. There's an outstanding request  
19 from two Board members to add to the agenda an item for every  
20 meeting on discussing rules. I think this was made at least two  
21 meetings ago. And I am not sure why it's not in the list or why it  
22 was not added to the agenda today. My understanding of the rules of  
23 boards in California is that two members have the right to propose  
24 any item for both, and it seems logical to me that they should also  
25 have the right to propose an agenda item, and that that should be  
26 followed. So, if I could have an update on where that is or whether  
27 we will see it in the agenda for the next meeting, that would be  
28 helpful.

1           **MS. URBAN:** Yes, I'm aware of that, and the agenda for the next  
2 meeting should include the priorities discussion. My understanding—  
3 we did talk about this—is that in, during this item,  
4 anybody can bring up future agenda items, including rules that they  
5 would like to see discussed. So, after I consulted with staff  
6 afterwards, and perhaps we just had a misunderstanding, but our  
7 understanding was that was where anybody could suggest regulation  
8 for future discussion just as they would otherwise..

9           **MS. DE LA TORRE:** I'm not sure if I asked or if Board member  
10 Mactaggart has joined, but my recollection is that there was a  
11 request to have an agenda item specific to discussing  
12 future rules.

13           **MS. URBAN:** Yes, we did discuss that, and we talked about  
14 whether we needed a specific agenda item or this agenda item would  
15 serve. And maybe we just misunderstood after I talked with staff  
16 later. We thought that this agenda item would include that. I don't  
17 have any strong feeling about it one way or the other. So let me go  
18 back with staff and see if your thinking, Ms. de la Torre, is that  
19 we need something that specifically says "Future Rulemaking Items."  
20 I have no objection to that.

21           **MS. DE LA TORRE:** So, let me make sure that I understand. So,  
22 what I'm hearing is that we can have a discussion on rules under  
23 Future Agenda Items, is that what I'm hearing?

24           **MS. URBAN:** Anyone can propose a future agenda item, and that  
25 includes a rule. Even if we have a separate agenda item for  
26 mentioning rule topics, we couldn't discuss those in substance  
27 because they wouldn't have been noticed for discussion; they  
28 would've just been something that was brought up in the meeting,

1 right? So, it's functionally the same, and then, but if it helps,  
2 however everyone is thinking about it, I'm happy to have an agenda  
3 item that's named "Suggestions for Future Rules."

4 **MS. DE LA TORRE:** Right, I don't disagree with your knowledge  
5 of how that should be said. Whatever you and the staff have  
6 identified as the requirement is perfectly fine with me. But my  
7 suggestion is that, if we as a Board have a conversation on  
8 priorities for rulemaking, it would be helpful for the public to  
9 see that reflected in the agenda because I'm not sure that it will  
10 be very intuitive to the public when they decide to attend one of  
11 these meetings that we're going to have such a discussion when they  
12 read "Future Agenda Items." But I obviously leave it up to you as a  
13 chair and with the advice of the staff to decide.

14 **MS. URBAN:** Yeah, so there are two steps: one is bringing it  
15 forward to being put on the agenda, and then one is discussing it  
16 in substance or how we want to prioritize it alongside other  
17 things. The second part most definitely needs its own agenda item.  
18 My understanding was that for each agenda, there would be the  
19 possibility that Board meetings would say, "You know what,  
20 something has come up, and I would like to point out or propose  
21 that we put this on a future agenda for discussion." ...which would  
22 allow staff to do some research and so forth. And that can happen  
23 under this agenda item, or it can happen under something that's  
24 named "Potential Future Regulations." But that substantive  
25 discussion and our discussion of priorities can't really happen  
26 anyway without it a noticed agenda item. There's two steps.

27 **MS. DE LA TORRE:** I'm a little confused, but if we could just  
28 take the request that Mr. Mactaggart and myself made two meetings

1 ago and make it possible to have that conversation, whatever that  
2 means for the agenda in the next meeting. I think it will be very  
3 appreciated.

4 **MS. URBAN:** Yes, absolutely. Absolutely. Mr. Le? Mr. Le?

5 **MR. LE:** Alright. I didn't catch the last of it. Did you call  
6 on me, Chair Urban?

7 **MS. URBAN:** I did.

8 **MR. LE:** Okay, yeah, sorry. My internet is not great. Yes, as  
9 two points, I think right now, Ms. de la Torre, it would be the  
10 time for you to suggest the specific rules that you'd like to be  
11 discussed at the next meeting. This is how I understood...

12 **MS. URBAN:** That's right.

13 **MR. LE:** ...that's how I understood the process. My understanding  
14 was similar to Chairman Urban's. It's like if we had a specific  
15 rule that we would like to be discussed, now would be the time to  
16 add it to the next Board meeting. And then my second point is a  
17 little unrelated, but to what Chair Urban raised, it is our hope  
18 that by the next Board meeting we can at least have some  
19 preliminary questions for the Board to discuss around the findings  
20 from the new rules committee and perhaps some threshold questions,  
21 assuming that we can get through all the comments in that time.  
22 But, yes, those are my two comments.

23 **MS. URBAN:** Wonderful. Thank you, Mr. Le. That's helpful. And I  
24 have. I've noted that down. The only clarification I would add with  
25 regards to proposing items for rulemaking is just that I know staff  
26 has a list of everything that has been brought up in previous  
27 meetings. So, we don't need to run through the whole list again  
28 every time or today. They're working on that. But if there are

1 additional items that either of you would like to go in the bucket  
2 and then be discussed in a substantive item in the next meeting,  
3 this would be great time to propose them. And if not, that's fine  
4 too because I know there's a good list that's already gotten  
5 started.

6       Okay, are there public comments and, also, you can think well  
7 while we wait for public comments too. Is there public comment on  
8 this item?

9       **MS. ALLEN:** Yes, we are on agenda item number five, which is  
10 Future Agenda Items. If you would like to make a comment, please  
11 raise your hand using the Zoom 'raise hand' feature or by pressing  
12 \*9 on your phone. Your name will be called when it's your turn and  
13 you'll be invited to unmute yourself. Those dialing in by phone can  
14 press \*6 to unmute, and you will have three minutes to make your  
15 comment.

16       Again, if you are interested in making a comment on agenda  
17 item number five, Future Agenda Items, please use the 'raise hand'  
18 feature or press \*9 on your phone, and you will have three minutes  
19 to make your comment.

20       Chair Urban, I see no hands.

21       **MS. URBAN:** Thank you, Ms. Allen. Any further items from Board  
22 members?

23       Alright, I already did have the rule prioritization on the  
24 list, but I've highlighted it and also highlighted a note for  
25 myself to go back and clarify, again, just exactly what we're  
26 calling things on the agenda. And I've noted that the new rule  
27 subcommittee will, of course, let probably Mr. Soltani know, who  
28 will let me know, if you need a spot on the next agenda. And

1 whenever we do have that discussion, I will look forward to it.

2 With that, let's move to agenda item number six.

3         Agenda item number six is a closed session discussion of two  
4 items. The first is a discussion of the executive director's  
5 appointment of the deputy director of public affairs under  
6 authority of Government Code section 11126, subdivision (a)(1). And  
7 the second agenda item is pursuant to Government Code section 11126  
8 subdivision (e)(1) and (2)(A). And for that the Board will meet in  
9 closed session to confer and receive advice from legal counsel  
10 regarding the following matter: California Chamber of Commerce vs.  
11 California Privacy Protection Agency et al., in the Superior Court  
12 of the State of California, Sacramento County. The case number is  
13 on your agenda if you would like to refer to that. As a logistical  
14 matter, the Board, as I mentioned at the top of the meeting, will  
15 leave the public session and will go into a closed session to  
16 discuss these items. During that time, we'll leave the public  
17 session here open. Members of the public, you are open to stay or  
18 to wander off or to leave since it's Friday afternoon. And we will  
19 return after we're done with the closed section to adjourn this  
20 session. Before we go into closed session, I'd like to ask if  
21 there's any public comment on these two items from anyone in the  
22 audience?

23         **MS. ALLEN:** Okay, we are on agenda item number six, the closed  
24 session for agenda items 6A or B. If you would like to make a  
25 comment, please raise your hand using the Zoom 'raise hand' feature  
26 or press \*9 on your phone. Your name will be called when it's your  
27 turn, and you'll be invited to unmute yourself. Those dialing in by  
28 phone can press \*6 to unmute, and you will have three minutes to



1 make your comment.

2        Alright. David Riviera, you may unmute yourself. Again, you  
3 have three minutes. Please proceed.

4        **DAVID RIVIERA:** Thank you, Chairperson Urban. Just to clarify:  
5 when you come back from the closed session, no other topics will be  
6 discussed by this body? You'll just immediately adjourn?

7        **MS. URBAN:** We will just be adjourning. Yes.

8        **DAVID RIVIERA:** Okay, thank you.

9        **MS. URBAN:** Thank you.

10       **MS. ALLEN:** Okay, if anyone else would like to make a comment  
11 on agenda item number six, the Closed Session, please raise your  
12 hand using the Zoom 'raise hand' feature or by pressing \*9 on your  
13 phone.

14        I see no other hands raised, Chair Urban.

15       **MS. URBAN:** Thank you very much, Ms. Allen. Thank you, Mr.  
16 Riviera, for the clarifying question, and thanks to everyone for  
17 attending this afternoon. The Board will now leave the public  
18 session for closed session discussion, and I'd like to invite Mr.  
19 Le and Ms. de la Torre to please do that. We will return when we  
20 are finished with those items in order to adjourn. Thanks everyone  
21 for joining us on a Friday afternoon.

22       **MS. URBAN:** Ms. Allen, I'm just letting you know that the Board  
23 is back, and we can reconvene the public session when you're ready  
24 and we are all here. I'm just checking... yes, we have everyone, so  
25 please let us know when to begin.

26       **MS. ALLEN:** Okay, go ahead and begin.

27       **MS. URBAN:** Thank you very much, Ms. Allen. And thanks again to  
28 all the members of the public who joined us today. Thank you to the

1 Board members for your time and expertise this afternoon. And of  
2 course, thank you very much to our expert staff for all of your  
3 contributions to the meeting and to our work. This is our last  
4 agenda item, number seven, and it is Adjournment. So, I will go  
5 right ahead and ask if I may have a motion to adjourn the meeting.

6 **MS. DE LA TORRE:** I move.

7 **MS. URBAN:** Thank you. I have a motion from Ms. de la Torre. Do  
8 I have a second?

9 **MR. ALASTAIR MACTAGGART:** Second.

10 **MS. URBAN:** Thank you. Motion is on the table from Ms. de la  
11 Torre, seconded by Mr. Mactaggart, to adjourn the meeting. Ms.  
12 Allen, would you please conduct the roll call vote?

13 **MS. ALLEN:** Yes, the motion is to adjourn. Board member de la  
14 Torre?

15 **MS. DE LA TORRE:** Aye.

16 **MS. ALLEN:** De la Torre, aye. Board member Le?

17 **MR. LE:** Aye.

18 **MS. ALLEN:** Le, aye. Board member Mactaggart?

19 **MR. MACTAGGART:** Aye.

20 **MS. ALLEN:** Mactaggart, aye. Chair Urban?

21 **MS. URBAN:** Aye.

22 **MS. ALLEN:** Urban, aye. With that, the motion carries in a vote  
23 four to zero.

24 **MS. URBAN:** Thank you, Ms. Allen. By a vote of four to zero,  
25 the motion carries to adjourn this meeting of the California  
26 Privacy Protection Agency Board, and we hereby stand adjourned.  
27 Thanks very much everybody.

28 (End of recording)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**TRANSCRIBER'S CERTIFICATE**

STATE OF CALIFORNIA            )  
  )  
  )  
COUNTY OF SACRAMENTO        )

This is to certify that I transcribed the foregoing pages 1 to 18 to the best of my ability from an audio recording provided to me. I have subscribed this certificate at \_\_\_\_\_, California,

Executed this \_\_\_\_ day of April, 2023.

By: \_\_\_\_\_

**FOCUS INTERPRETING**  
--o0o--